

THE NEW YORK CITY LANDMARKS PRESERVATION COMMISSION 1 CENTRE STREET 9TH FLOOR NORTH NEW YORK NY 10007 TEL: 212 669-7700 FAX: 212 669-7780



PERMIT CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS

ISSUE DATE:	EXPIRATION DATE:	DOCKET #:	COFA
05/18/17	11/22/2022	LPC-19-11323	COFA-19-11323
<u>ADDRESS:</u>		BOROUGH	BLOCK/LOT:
327 WEST 4TH STREET		Manhattan	615/58
Greenwich Village Historic District			

Display This Permit While Work Is In Progress

ISSUED TO:

David Slaven, Member 327 West 4th, LLC 56-02 Maspeth Avenue Maspeth, NY 11378

NOT ORIGINAL COMPUTER-GENERATED COPY

Pursuant to Section 25-307 of the Administrative Code of the City of New York, the Landmarks Preservation Commission, at the Public Meeting of November 22, 2016 following the Public Meeting and the Public Hearing of October 25, 2016, voted to grant a Certificate of Appropriateness for the proposed work at the subject premises, as put forth in your application completed on October 6, 2016, and as you were notified in Status Update Letter 19-5784 (LPC 18-5249), issued on November 28, 2016.

The proposal, as approved, consists of altering the rear (east) façade, including painting façade elements, including the cornice and windows black (Benjamin Moore "Tricorn Black SW 6258"); work at the rear ell, including removing the full-height metal boiler flue at the east façade at the rear ell; raising the ell one (1) story; removing the four (4) windows at the east façade and blocking the openings with brick infill, retaining the sills and lintels; removing the four (4) windows at the north façade and installing three (3) 6-over-6 double-hung wood windows at the 2nd through 4th floors; installing a 2-story 2-panel-wide steel window assembly at the cellar and 1st floors; work at the east façade, including demolishing the existing 2-story wood-framed lean-to addition; removing two (2) windows at the east façade at the cellar and 1st floors; installing a two-story 4-panel-wide glass and steel French door assembly at the cellar and 1st floors, with a metal deck and cable railing; removing four (4) windows and two (2) through-wall louvers at the 2nd and 3rd floors; and installing two (2) French Casement wood windows with cable railing guards at the 2nd floor; installing two (2) 6-over-6 double-hung wood windows at the 3rd floor; work at the rear yard, including

removing the concrete stairs at the rear yard and the concealed concrete-walled boiler room at the cellar floor at the northeast, and instead installing garden bedding; excavating the rear vard at the southeast immediately adjacent to the rear ell, and constructing a concrete mechanical chamber at cellar level with one (1) louvered metal door at the north facade; installing a new metal bar-b-que atop at the 1st floor level; constructing a concrete stair leading from the northeast rear yard at cellar level to the southeast yard with two (2) pairs of metal doors accessing under-stair storage; and also work at the roof, including removing existing vents and one (1) chimney at the easternmost section at the south party wall; constructing a singlestory rooftop addition set back 8' from the West 4th Street facade and set back 3' from the east (rear) facade with the West 4th Street facade pitched and clad in standing seam zinc plating with a 6-panel operable awning window assembly and a metal access ladder at the north end; a 3'6" tall cable railing behind the West 4th Street parapet, and stone pavers at the roof; reconstructing, angling, and raising to the same pitch the chimney at the northwest at the West 4th Street facade, finished with standing seam zinc plating at the West 4th Street pitch; cladding the raised and angled chimney and the exposed north facade at the rooftop addition with a reddish brown brick; installing a single-light fixed lot-line window at the north facade; installing a wrap-around 5-panel steel and glass window and door assembly at the northeast corner at the 4th floor, including a 1-panel fixed window at the north facade and the remaining 4 panels at the east facade opening onto the terraced setback; rebuilding and widening the brick chimney at the south party wall fronting West 4th Street; installing one (1) HVAC unit encased in a standing seam aluminum sound dampening HVAC enclosure screen; constructing a 7'8" tall standing-seam aluminum and glass stair bulkhead with a sun roof; installing a metal bar-b-que grill and an outdoor gas fireplace, both inset into a brick masonry bulkhead attached to the chimney extension at the westernmost end at the south party wall; and installing a cable rail enclosing the roof deck that is set back 2'6" from West 4th Street facade at the roof; as presented at the Public Meeting and Public Hearing of October 25, 2016 in a digital presentation titled "327 West 4th Street New York, NY 10014 LPC Docket #18-5249" dated October 25, 2016, and as presented at the Public Meeting of November 22, 2016 in a digital presentation dated November 22, 2016, all prepared by Bade Stageberg Cox, including slides consisting of historic and existing condition photographs, drawings, photomontages, and material and finish samples, all presented as components of the application. As initially presented, the proposal included installing modern entrance infill, cladding with standing seam aluminum the north façade at the proposed rooftop addition, raising and widening the brick chimney at 329 West 4th Street without angling it back, and constructing a full-height masonry brick stair bulkhead with a brick latticework-screened mechanical enclosure at the rear.

In reviewing this proposal, the Commission noted that the Greenwich Village Historic District Designation Report describes 327 West 4th Street as a Federal style rowhouse built in 1827-1828; and that the building's scale, style, materials and details are among the features that contribute to the special architectural and historic character of the Greenwich Village Historic District.

With regard to this proposal, the Commission found that the proposed work will not eliminate any significant historic fabric; that although black was not a color originally used for fenestration on Federal era buildings, the building has been altered over time and exhibits features from these later alterations, thereby supporting the proposed color scheme; that the limited excavation at the rear yard adjacent to the rear façade, much of which was previously excavated for a below grade vault, will not significantly alter the relationship of this yard to the neighboring yards; that the proposed rear yard excavation will be designed and built in compliance with Department of Buildings regulations under the supervision of a licensed professional engineer to protect the building's facades and the adjacent buildings; that the alterations to the lower floors at the rear façade and rear yard will not be visible from any public thoroughfares; that although the proposed fenestration at the rear façade will no longer reflect the original pattern, it will be regularized in a manner consistent with the adjacent townhouse; that the proposed double-height window assembly, featuring multi-light windows divided by mullions and a spandrel panel between floors, will reference the floor plate and have a level of texture and scale in keeping with the character of a rowhouse; that the design

Page 2 Issued: 05/18/17 DOCKET #: LPC-19-11323 of the proposed rooftop addition with a sloped front, featuring zinc cladding and a large operable assembly of multi-light metal windows, will be evocative of artist studio windows characteristic of the historic district; that the stair bulkhead, featuring a low metal and glass assembly with an operable roof, simple metal railings, and metal flue extensions integrated into the body of the rooftop addition, and the one-story enlargement of the brick extension with screened rooftop mechanical equipment, will utilize materials typical of rooftop structures and will be seen in context with a larger adjacent apartment building, helping these elements recede from view; and that the proposed work will not diminish the special architectural or historic character of the building and the Greenwich Village Historic District. Based on these findings, the Commission determined the work to be appropriate to the building and the historic district and voted to approve this proposal. However, in voting to approve the work, the Commission required that the applicant work with staff to increase the amount of glazing at the studio window, use brick cladding at the side wall of the rooftop addition, and set back the railings on the rooftop addition to reduce visibility. Furthermore, the applicant volunteered to eliminate the modern entrance infill from the proposal and to put forward at a later date a proposal that meets the criteria for a staff level approval to better recall Federal style entrance as seen at the adjacent 329 West 4th Street.

Subsequently on March 1, 2017, the Commission received a digital presentation titled "Additional Materials" dated March 1, 2017 and prepared by Bade Stageberg Cox, including 14 slides, consisting of photographs, drawings, photomontages, and subsequently thereafter on April 14, 2017, the Commission received filing drawings labeled T-001.00, DM-110.00, DM-111.00, DM-112.00, G-001.00, G-002.00, Z-001.00, A-101.00, A-102.00, A-103.00, A-200.00, A-201.00, A-300.00, A-301.00, A-302.00, A-500.00, A-501.00, A-505.00, A-510.00, A-530.00, A-531.00, A-533.00, A-600.00, A-601.00, A-602.00, A-603.00, A-604.00, A-605.00, A-606.00, A-607.00, A-608.00, A-700.00, A-701.00, A-702.00, and BPP-1.00, dated (revised) April 4, 2017 and prepared by Martin Peter Cox, R.A. and drawings labeled T-100.00, SOE-100.00, SOE-200.00, SOE-300.00, SOE-301.00, SOE-400.00, SOE-401.00, SOE-402.00, SOE-500.00, SOE-501.00, SOE-502.00, dated April 4, 2017 and prepared by Paul B. Shim, P.E.; and drawings labeled F-110.00, S-111.00, S-112.00, S-113.00, S-200.00, S-201.00, S-203.00, S-204.00, S-205.00, S-210.00, S-211.00, S-215.00, S-300.00, S-400.00, and S-401.00, dated April 7, 2016 and prepared by Scott E. Hughes, P.E., and drawings labeled M-100.00, M-300.00, M-301.00, M-400.00, M-500.00, M-600.00, P-100.00, P-300.00, P-400.00, SP-301.00, SP-300.00, SP-301.00, SP-301.00, S-201.00, S-201.00, S-203.00, S-204.00, S-205.00, S-210.00, S-211.00, S-215.00, S-200.00, S-201.00, S-203.00, S-204.00, S-205.00, S-210.00, S-211.00, S-215.00, S-300.00, S-400.00, M-301.00, M-400.00, M-500.00, M-600.00, P-100.00, P-300.00, P-301.00, P-400.00, SP-300.00, SP-301.00, SP-301.00, and SP-400.00, dated (revised) March 23, 2017 and prepared by David D. Teng, P.E.

Accordingly, staff reviewed these materials and noted that the required changes had been made, including increasing the amount of glazing at the West 4th Street facade studio window, using brick cladding at the side wall at the rooftop addition, and setting back farther the railings at the rooftop addition to reduce visibility. Staff also noted that a setback 7'8" tall rooftop staircase bulkhead was proposed in lieu of the approved 3'8" tall rooftop box hatch that had been presented at the Public Meeting of November 22, 2016. Staff further noted that the filing drawings included additional work, including at the West 4th Street entrance consisting of removing the existing entrance infill and installing a new door, sidelights, transom, and surround modeled after the adjacent 329 West 4th Street; resurfacing and carving the brownstone entrance lintel; removing and relocating the Siamese connection at the areaway at West 4th Street; removing and reinstalling the existing areaway gate; temporarily removing and reinstalling iron basement entrance gate: installing two (2) recessed trash enclosures at cast stone walls with round wood lids, finished brown to match the masonry; repairing iron railings and installing new iron finials at the stoop newels; removing eight (8) 6-over-6 double-hung wood windows at the West 4th Street facade, and installing six (6) 6-over-6 double-hung wood windows at the 2nd and 3rd floors, and two (2) 6-over-9 double-hung wood windows at the 1st floor, all finished black; installing one (1) through-wall vent at the rear (east) facade at the 1st floor; and removing existing bluestone sidewalk flags and installing the new bluestone sidewalk flags laid horizontally outboard and longitudinally at curbside.

> Page 3 Issued: 05/18/17 DOCKET #: LPC-19-11323

With regard to this additional work, staff found that in accordance with the provisions set forth in Title 63 of the Rules of the City of New York, Section 2-11, that the vent installation will not be visible from any public thoroughfare; that the vent will be mounted flush with the exterior wall; that no decorative masonry or other significant architectural feature of the building will be affected by the installation; and in accordance with the provisions set forth in Section 2-17, that the basis for the design of the proposed restoration's authenticity for the entrance infill and stoop railings is documented by photographic evidence, and matching buildings; that the restoration will not cause the removal of significant historic fabric that may have been added over time and that are evidence of the history and development of a building, structure or site; and in accordance with the provisions of Section 3-04, that the replacement of the existing windows at the primary facades is warranted by their deteriorated conditions; and that the proposed replacement windows will match the historic windows in terms of configuration, operation, details, material, and finish; and at the secondary facades, that the windows to be removed are not special windows, as defined by Section 3 or Appendix C of the Rules; that the replacement windows will be installed within existing masonry openings at a secondary facade; and that the work will not be visible from any public thoroughfares. Furthermore, that the replacement of the existing non-historic door at the rear will not eliminate any original historic fabric or diminish any significant alterations, added over time; that the work will not be visible from any public thoroughfares; that the brick cleaning will utilize the gentlest effective methods available and without damaging the masonry; that only low pressure water rinses, not to exceed 500 psi will be used; that the use of electric grinders for cutting masonry joints will be limited to the extent to which they will not damage the existing masonry; that the pointing mortar will be compatible with the masonry in terms of composition and will match the historic mortar in terms of profiles, texture, and finish; that the brownstone patching compound will be compatible with the masonry in terms of composition and will match the historic masonry in terms of texture, finish, profiles and details; that the temporary removal and reinstallation of the iron gates and window guards will facilitate their protection during construction; that the iron gates and window guards will be promptly be reinstalled in its historic location after the completion of the work at the areaway; that the replacement of the existing bluestone pavers is warranted by their deteriorated condition; that the replacement pavers will match the historic pavers in terms of material, pattern, dimensions, and finish; and that the work will support the special architectural and historic character of the site, streetscape and historic district. Additionally, staff found that the design approved by the Commission has been maintained. Based on these and the above findings, the drawings have been marked approved with a perforated seal, and Certificate of Appropriateness 19-11323 is being issued.

Please note that this permit is being issued contingent upon the Commission's review and approval of samples for brownstone patching, pointing mortar, new brick, iron railing repair, bluestone, and shop drawings for the new entrance, iron railing and newels, and windows, prior to the commencement of work. Samples should be installed adjacent to clean, original surfaces being repaired; allowed to cure; and cleaned of residue. Promptly submit the requested materials to the Commission staff. Digital photographs of all samples may be sent via e-mail to James Russiello at jrussiello@lpc.nyc.gov for review. This permit is also contingent on the understanding that the work masonry work will be performed by hand and when the temperature remains a constant 45 degrees Fahrenheit or above for a 72 hour period from the commencement of the work.

As the approved work consists of subsurface work, the applicant is required to strictly adhere to the Department of Buildings' TPPN 10/88 governing in-ground construction adjacent to historic buildings. It is the applicant's obligation at the time of applying for their DOB permit to inform DOB that the TPPN applies.

This permit is issued on the basis of the building and site conditions described in the application and disclosed during the review process. By accepting this permit, the applicant agrees to notify the Commission if the actual building or site conditions vary or if original or historic building fabric is discovered. The Commission reserves the right to amend or revoke this permit, upon written notice to the applicant, in the

Page 4 Issued: 05/18/17 DOCKET #: LPC-19-11323 event that the actual building or site conditions are materially different from those described in the application or disclosed during the review process.

All approved drawings are marked approved by the Commission with a perforated seal indicating the date of the approval. The work is limited to what is contained in the perforated document. Other work or amendments to this filing must be reviewed and approved separately. The applicant is hereby put on notice that performing or maintaining any work not explicitly authorized by this permit may make the applicant liable for criminal and/or civil penalties, including imprisonment and fine. This letter constitutes the permit; a copy must be prominently displayed at the site while work is in progress. Please direct inquiries to James Russiello.

Meenakshi Srinivasan Chair

PLEASE NOTE: PERFORATED DRAWINGS AND A COPY OF THIS PERMIT HAVE BEEN SENT TO:

Anna Kandalina, Conversano Associates

cc: Caroline Kane Levy, Deputy Director; Anna Kandalina, Conversano Associates; Cory S. Herrala, Director of Technical Affairs, Sustainability and Resiliency; Jared Knowles, Director of Preservation; Martin Peter Cox, AIA, Bade Stageberg Cox; Karl Landsteiner, Bade Stageberg Cox